



OFFICE *of the* ATTORNEY GENERAL  
GREG ABBOTT

December 16, 2002

Mr. James M. Frazier III  
Assistant General Counsel  
Office of the General Counsel  
Texas Department of Criminal Justice  
P.O. Box 4004  
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2002-7177

Dear Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 173701.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received two requests from the same requestor for any documents or letters regarding a specified inmate, including three specific letters. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you acknowledge that the department has not sought an open records decision from this office within the ten business day time period, nor provided this office with the required documents within the fifteen business day time period, as prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code. See Gov't Code § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. See Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.--Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Normally, a compelling reason for non-disclosure exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Thus, we will address your arguments under sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.134 of the Government Code.

Section 552.134(a) of the Government Code states in pertinent part:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029, information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). The submitted letters that you seek to withhold concern an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by the department. Section 552.029 of the Government Code does not apply to this information. Accordingly, the department must withhold these letters pursuant to section 552.134 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. You assert that the remaining submitted information is made confidential by section 508.313 of the Government Code. In pertinent part, section 508.313 states:

(a) All information obtained and maintained, including a victim protest letter or other correspondence, a victim impact statement, a list of inmates eligible for release on parole, and an arrest record of an inmate, is confidential and privileged if the information relates to:

- (1) an inmate of the institutional division subject to release on parole, release to mandatory supervision, or executive clemency;
- (2) a releasee; or
- (3) a person directly identified in any proposed plan of release for an inmate.

You indicate that the remaining submitted information relates to an inmate who is currently incarcerated in the department's Telford Unit and that this information is maintained by the Parole Division of the department while the inmate is incarcerated. Further, you state that the Parole Board most recently denied this inmate parole in March of this year. Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we agree that the remaining submitted information is made confidential by section 508.313(a)(1) and must therefore be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

In summary, we conclude that: 1) you must withhold the submitted letters pursuant to section 552.134 of the Government Code; and 2) you must withhold the remaining submitted information under 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 508.313 of

the Government Code. As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your remaining arguments.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge

this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

WMM/lmt

Ref: ID# 173701

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Allen D. Place, Jr.  
Attorney at Law  
109 South 7<sup>th</sup> Street  
Gatesville, Texas 76528  
(w/o enclosures)